[AP] Editor Decision

14 pesan

Michelle O'Hara <Michelle.Ohara@cvut.cz>   Kam, 18 Feb 2021 pukul 15.22
Kepada: Rustam Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>, Koredianto Usman <korediantousman@telkomuniversity.ac.id>, Mudyawati Kamaruddin <mudya07@gmail.com>, Dina Chamidah <dinachamidah_fbs@uwks.ac.id>, Nopendri Nopendri <nopendri@telkomuniversity.ac.id>, Khaerudin Saleh <khaerudin@telkomuniversity.ac.id>, Yulinda Eliskar <yulindaeliskar@gmail.com>, Ismail Marzuki <ismailmz@unifa.ac.id>

Dear Rustam Rustam, Koredianto Usman, Mudyawati Kamaruddin, Dina Chamidah, Nopendri Nopendri, Khaerudin Saleh, Yulinda Eliskar, Ismail Marzuki:

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Acta Polytechnica, "Modified Possibilistic Fuzzy c-Means Algorithm for Clustering Incomplete Data Sets".

Our decision is to: Accept Submission.

Please upload all the supplementary files to your article:

source text (.tex or .doc format),
references (.bib format),
all figures from your article (.pdf, . jpg or .png format).

Best regards,

Michelle O'Hara

Michelle.Ohara@cvut.cz

_____

Acta Polytechnica Editorial Office

Central Library

Czech Technical University in Prague

Technická 6

160 80 Praha 6 - Dejvice

Czech Republic

http://ojs.cvut.cz/ojs/index.php/ap

Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>   Kam, 18 Feb 2021 pukul 21.13
Kepada: Michelle O'Hara <Michelle.Ohara@cvut.cz>

Dear Editor,

Here we attach all the supplementary files including source text (.tex), references (.bib format), and all figures.

Best regards,
Rustam
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>   Sen, 22 Feb 2021 pukul 13.31
Kepada: Michelle O'Hara <Michelle.Ohara@cvut.cz>

Dear Editor,

We apologize to resend this file due to a typo in Equation 12.

Best regards,
Rustam
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Michelle O'Hara <michelle.ohara@cvut.cz>   Sel, 23 Feb 2021 pukul 03.30
Kepada: Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>

Dear Rustam,

Can you please re-send the files? We were unable to open it.
Thanks,
Michelle

  <Rustam.rar>

Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>   Sel, 23 Feb 2021 pukul 07.37
Kepada: Michelle O'Hara <michelle.ohara@cvut.cz>

Dear Editor,

Here we resend the file. Hopefully, this file can open properly.

Best regards,
Rustam
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Michelle O'Hara <michelle.ohara@cvut.cz>   Sel, 23 Feb 2021 pukul 20.18
Kepada: Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>

Dear Rustam,

Sorry to brother you but could you please send either all the files individually or as a standart zip? We are having trouble with the .rar files.
Thanks,
Michelle

> On Feb 23, 2021, at 1:37 AM, Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id> wrote:
>
> <Rustam.rar>

Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>   Sel, 23 Feb 2021 pukul 20.35
Kepada: Michelle O'Hara <michelle.ohara@cvut.cz>

Dear Editor,

We apologize for bothering you. Here, we send all the files individually.

Best Regards,
Rustam
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Michelle O'Hara <michelle.ohara@cvut.cz>   Sel, 23 Feb 2021 pukul 20.38
Kepada: Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>

Thank you, Rustam.

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

<actapoly-astro.bst><actapoly.bst><actapoly.cls><artificial_1.jpg><biblio.bib><AKURASI_GABUNGAN.jpg><Final_Manuscript_Acta_2.synctex><RUSTAM.aux><CENTROID_GABUNGAN.jpg><RUSTAM.bbl><RUSTAM.blg><ITERASI_GABUNGAN.jpg><RUSTAM.log><RUSTAM.out><NPSPFCM_GABUNGAN.jpg><OCSPFCM_GABUNGAN.jpg><RUSTAM.synctex.gz><RUSTAM.tex>

Michelle O'Hara <michelle.ohara@cvut.cz>   Jum, 26 Feb 2021 pukul 03.30
Kepada: Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>

Dear Rustam,

We also need your article as a pdf. Can you please email me the final version as a pdf?
Thanks,
Michelle

> On Feb 23, 2021, at 2:35 PM, Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id> wrote:
>
> <OCSPFCM_GABUNGAN.jpg>

Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>   Jum, 26 Feb 2021 pukul 08.18
Kepada: Michelle O'Hara <michelle.ohara@cvut.cz>

Dear Editor,

We apologize for not attaching the final version of the pdf file. Here we have attached it.

We have asked the editor whether our paper will be published in Vol. 61 No. 2 in late April or early May?

Best regards,
Rustam
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Michelle O'Hara <michelle.ohara@cvut.cz>   Jum, 26 Feb 2021 pukul 19.37
Kepada: Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>

Dear Rustam,

Yes, your article will be published at the end of April.
Best,
Michelle

<RUSTAM.pdf>

Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>   Sen, 15 Mar 2021 pukul 22.00
Kepada: Michelle O'Hara <michelle.ohara@cvut.cz>

Dear Editor,

We would like to edit our submission "Modified Possibilistic Fuzzy c-Means Algorithm for Clustering Incomplete Data Sets" on abstracts and references as there are changes based on the reviewers' suggestions. However, we were unable to do this because the save button cannot be clicked after editing. We ask the Editor for help and guidance in this matter.

Best regards,
Rustam
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Michelle O'Hara <michelle.ohara@cvut.cz>   Rab, 17 Mar 2021 pukul 01.24
Kepada: Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>

Dear Rustam,

Send me your article as a pdf with the changes marked in a different color.

Michelle
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>   Rab, 17 Mar 2021 pukul 21.27
Kepada: Michelle O'Hara <michelle.ohara@cvut.cz>

Dear Editor,

Here we attach a PDF file that has been marked with different colors in the sections that need to be adjusted in the OJS system.
We marked all sentences in the abstract because there were sentence adjustments until this paper was accepted.
In the reference section, we marked all references because, at the time of submitting this paper, we had not included the DOI in the cited references.

Best regards,
Rustam
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

[AP] Editor Decision

3 pesan

Michelle O'Hara <Michelle.Ohara@cvut.cz>   Kam, 4 Feb 2021 pukul 05.10
Kepada: Rustam Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>, Koredianto Usman
<korediantousman@telkomuniversity.ac.id>, Mudyawati Kamaruddin <mudya07@gmail.com>, Dina Chamidah
<dinachamidah_fbs@uwks.ac.id>, Nopendri Nopendri <nopendri@telkomuniversity.ac.id>, Khaerudin Saleh
<khaerudin@telkomuniversity.ac.id>, Yulinda Eliskar <yulindaeliskar@gmail.com>, Ismail Marzuki <ismailmz@unifa.ac.id>

Dear Rustam Rustam, Koredianto Usman, Mudyawati Kamaruddin, Dina Chamidah, Nopendri Nopendri, Khaerudin Saleh, Yulinda Eliskar, Ismail Marzuki:

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Acta Polytechnica, "Modified Possibilistic Fuzzy c-Means Algorithm for Clustering Incomplete Data Sets".

Our decision is: Revisions required.

Please upload your revised article according to the points below with the changes marked in another color. Also, include a letter of response.

Contact me with any questions.

Best regards.

Michelle O'Hara

Reviewer C:

Thank you for your response. Unfortunately, this question:

"Finally, would it be possible to add experimental results for more than two clusters? Currently, both approaches have a "similar" structure, which can be "preferred" by your algorithm."

is still not answered - where are some tables and charts presenting those 5 cluster datasets? It is very unclear how you made your changes - please add "red" highlights to show the differences and also clearly present results for 2 and 5 clusters, separately.

Recommendation: Revisions Required

Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>   Sab, 6 Feb 2021 pukul 09.36
Kepada: Michelle O'Hara <Michelle.Ohara@cvut.cz>

Dear Editor,

Here we attach our revised article and the answer to the question of reviewer C. We also have uploaded the revised version in the system.

Best regards,
Rustam
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>   Sab, 6 Feb 2021 pukul 21.34
Kepada: Michelle O'Hara <Michelle.Ohara@cvut.cz>

Dear Editor,

Here we attach our answer to the reviewer question.

Best regards,
Rustam
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

[AP] Editor Decision

3 pesan

Michelle O'Hara <Michelle.Ohara@cvut.cz>   Sab, 12 Des 2020 pukul 03.54
Kepada: Rustam Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>, Koredianto Usman
<korediantousman@telkomuniversity.ac.id>, Mudyawati Kamaruddin <mudya07@gmail.com>, Dina Chamidah
<dinachamidah_fbs@uwks.ac.id>, Nopendri Nopendri <nopendri@telkomuniversity.ac.id>, Khaerudin Saleh
<khaerudin@telkomuniversity.ac.id>, Yulinda Eliskar <yulindaeliskar@gmail.com>, Ismail Marzuki <ismailmz@unifa.ac.id>

Dear Rustam Rustam, Koredianto Usman, Mudyawati Kamaruddin, Dina Chamidah, Nopendri Nopendri, Khaerudin
Saleh, Yulinda Eliskar, Ismail Marzuki:

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Acta Polytechnica, "Modified Possibilistic Fuzzy c-Means
Algorithm for Clustering Incomplete Data Sets".

Our decision is: Resubmit for review.

Please upload a revised article according to the reviews below. Also, upload three letters of response, one for each
reviewer. The letter should contain detailed point-by-point answers responding to each question and/or comment of
the reviewer.

Do not hesitate to contact me with any questions.

Best regards,

Michelle O'Hara

Michelle.Ohara@cvut.cz

Reviewer E:
Recommendation: Revisions Required

Is the topic of this paper relevant to Acta Polytechnica?

>	Yes

Does the manuscript contain original and significant information?

>	Yes

Does the Abstract describe the content of the paper?

>	No

Do the authors inform clearly about aim of the paper?

>	Yes

Is the methodology described precisely and accurately?

>	Yes

Is the approach and solution used by the authors appropriate, and is it described clearly?

>	No

Are the Conclusions justified by the results?

Yes

Can the paper be published in its present form, without major language revision?

No

Comments to the Author(s):

This paper proposes a modified PCM algorithm for clustering incomplete data sets. In general terms, the algorithm shows a better performance when the NPSPFCM algorithm is applied and the main results illustrate such observation. However, several observations and questions are mentioned below:

1) The abstract must mention the most relevant results (%Error, MSE, among others) so that the reader knows the most important information about the results.

2) Add a mathematical nomenclature table before the introduction.

3) It is recommended to increase the resolution and contrast of Figures (> 500 dpi).

4) An analysis of the computational cost for the proposed algorithm is recommended.

5) ¿β and δ values applied to the experimental results? ¿Maximum number of iterations? ¿time machine?

6) It is important to show the performance of the convergence algorithm, from a graphical point of view for the experiments.

7) State-of-the-art is weak in the introduction section. I recommend to update the reference with recent papers between 2019-2020.

8) Please give a frank account of the weaknesses of the proposed algorithm.

9) It is recommended to experiment with databases with missing data from larger numbers of samples.

10) Why did you not compare the performance of the NPSPFCM and OCSPFCM algorithms with the following algorithms:
a) Clustering incomplete data using KFCM algorithm.
b) IKFCM algorithm for incomplete data.
c) FCM based on probabilistic information granules for incomplete data.

Reviewer F:
Recommendation: Decline Submission

Is the topic of this paper relevant to Acta Polytechnica?

Yes

Does the manuscript contain original and significant information?

No

Does the Abstract describe the content of the paper?

Yes

Do the authors inform clearly about aim of the paper?

No

Is the methodology described precisely and accurately?

No

Is the approach and solution used by the authors appropriate, and is it described clearly?

No

Are the Conclusions justified by the results?

Yes

Can the paper be published in its present form, without major language revision?

No

Comments to the Author(s):

There is no novelty in the paper. The authors have simply embedded the two strategies proposed by bezdek and Hathway out of given four strategies and made the comparison. The proposed approach is not compared with any of the algorithms available for missing data, hence the efficiency of the proposed approach can not be justified.

Reviewer R:
Recommendation: Revisions Required

Is the topic of this paper relevant to Acta Polytechnica?

Yes

Does the manuscript contain original and significant information?

Yes

Does the Abstract describe the content of the paper?

Yes

Do the authors inform clearly about aim of the paper?

Yes

Is the methodology described precisely and accurately?

Yes

Is the approach and solution used by the authors appropriate, and is it described clearly?

Yes

Are the Conclusions justified by the results?

Yes

Can the paper be published in its present form, without major language revision?

Yes

Comments to the Author(s):

Thank you for your submission. This is interesting work with interesting results. The quality of the manuscript could be improved if there would be some baseline solution added, or method from other research, so you can compare your results with other approaches. At this stage, it is very hard to validate if your results are "good enough".

Finally, would it be possible to add experimental results for more than two clusters? Currently, both approaches have a "similar" structure, which can be "preferred" by your algorithm.

_____

Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>   Min, 17 Jan 2021 pukul 14.22
Kepada: Michelle O'Hara <Michelle.Ohara@cvut.cz>

Dear Editor,

We apologize for the delay in resubmitting our paper. We try to accommodate all feedback from reviewers. So we need more time to improve our paper. We hope that the quality of the paper will improve by revising it according to reviewers' suggestions.
Here I attach three letters, one for each reviewer. I have also uploaded the revised article according to reviewer comments.

Best Regards
Rustam

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Rustam <rustamtelu@telkomuniversity.ac.id>   Kam, 4 Feb 2021 pukul 06.08
Kepada: Rustam Pasennangi <rustam.math06@gmail.com>

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]